Michele King

Subject: FW: Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter comment letter regarding the Investigation Report concerning

Santa Clara Valley Water District Director Gary Kremen

Attachments: Sierra Club comment on Kremen investigation Executive Summary 11.7.22.pdf

From: Barbara Kelsey <barbara.kelsey@sierraclub.org>

Sent: Monday, November 7, 2022 5:43 PM

To: Clerk of the Board <<u>clerkoftheboard@valleywater.org</u>>; Board of Directors <<u>board@valleywater.org</u>> **Cc:** James Eggers <<u>james.eggers@sierraclub.org</u>>; Charles Schafer <<u>c_g_schafer@yahoo.com</u>>; Katja

katja.irvin@sbcglobal.net; Gladwyn d'Souza godsouza@mac.com; Mike Ferreira MichaelJFerreira@gmail.com>
Subject: Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter comment letter regarding the Investigation Report concerning Santa Clara Valley Water Dietrict Director Cary Kromen

Valley Water District Director Gary Kremen

*** This email originated from outside of Valley Water. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe. ***

November 7, 2022

To: Valley Water Board of Directors

In March 2022, the Valley Water Board of Directors initiated an investigation to determine "[w]hether Director Kremen ... violated any Valley Board Governance Policies with respect to interaction with Valley Water staff ... [or] with respect to his treatment of members of the public at Valley Water meetings." The Sierra Club together with Restore the Delta had filed a complaint highlighting "disrespectful treatment from Director Gary Kremen towards environmental advocates."

On October 25, 2022 Valley Water released an Executive Summary of the investigation of complaints about Director Kremen's actions as a Director on Valley Water's board. The report concluded that, in six situations with staff, Director Kremen violated Governance Policy 6.3.1 which states that "Board members shall refrain from abusive conduct, personal charges, or verbal assaults upon the character or motives of ... staff and the public." The report also concluded that Director Kremen violated Governance Policy 6.3 which states that "Board members may not attempt to exercise individual authority over the organization." There must be consequences for these violations. We encourage the Board to consider appropriate sanctions against Director Kremen.

Please find our full comment letter attached.

Sincerely,

James Eggers Executive Director Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter

Cc: Charles Schafer Chapter Chair Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter

Katja Irvin

Sent by:

Barbara Kelsey

she/her/hers

Chapter Coordinator

Sierra Club, Loma Prieta Chapter

3921 E. Bayshore Rd, Suite 204

Palo Alto, CA 94303

barbara.kelsey@sierraclub.org

We are still working remotely

most of the time, so email is

the best contact method.



SAN MATEO, SANTA CLARA & SAN BENITO COUNTIES

November 7, 2022

To: Valley Water Board of Directors

Sent via e-mail: board@valleywater.org and clerkoftheboard@valleywater.org

Re: Investigation Report concerning Santa Clara Valley Water District Director Gary Kremen

In March 2022, the Valley Water Board of Directors initiated an investigation to determine "[w]hether Director Kremen ... violated any Valley Board Governance Policies with respect to interaction with Valley Water staff ... [or] with respect to his treatment of members of the public at Valley Water meetings." The Sierra Club together with Restore the Delta had filed a complaint highlighting "disrespectful treatment from Director Gary Kremen towards environmental advocates."

On October 25, 2022 Valley Water released an Executive Summary of the investigation of complaints about Director Kremen's actions as a Director on Valley Water's board. The report concluded that, in six situations with staff, Director Kremen violated Governance Policy 6.3.1 which states that "Board members shall refrain from abusive conduct, personal charges, or verbal assaults upon the character or motives of ... staff and the public." The report also concluded that Director Kremen violated Governance Policy 6.3 which states that "Board members may not attempt to exercise individual authority over the organization." There must be consequences for these violations. We encourage the Board to consider appropriate sanctions against Director Kremen.

However, the report did not find "that Kremen made any 'personal charge(s)' or 'verbal assault(s)' upon any Sierra Club member's 'character or motives'" (per GP-6.3.1). This determination was justified because "Kremen's comments about the Sierra Club were not aimed at any particular Sierra Club members, but at the organization as a whole" and "were not made in direct response to the comments made by any of the members at the meeting." Furthermore, the report did not find "that Kremen's conduct was 'abusive' (i.e., extremely offensive or cruel) as understood in [the] report" (per GP-6.3.1).

Nonetheless, the report stated the following regarding disrespectful and disparaging comments by Director Kremen aimed at the Sierra Club and other environmental organizations during board meetings:

- Kremen's comment stating the Sierra Club is "well known for its...white privilege position" left
 investigators "troubled by the use of a racially charged statement from the dais," and
 investigators "acknowledge[d] that Kremen's statements may have been rude,
 counterproductive, unprofessional, and inconsistent with GP-7, the District's Values Statement,
 or GP-11, the Inclusion, Equal Employment Opportunity, Discrimination/Harassment
 Prevention, and Diversity policy."
- Kremen's comment stating "This kind of shameful conduct that appears over and over again by a couple of small members of the Sierra Club: 'Oh I don't want X so people can have 10 times the price of water especially disadvantaged communities' [i]t's shameful to me this lack of social justice and putting plants over people" in response to comments on CEQA compliance, "may have been rude, counterproductive, unprofessional, and inconsistent with GP-7, the

District's Values Statement, or GP-11, the Inclusion, Equal Employment Opportunity, Discrimination/Harassment Prevention, and Diversity policy."

Director Kremen responded to San Jose Spotlight's request for comment as follows:

"As a fighter for the interests of taxpayers and water ratepayers, it is within my duties to not only question whether the mission, policies and procedures of the district are being fulfilled but to insist that the direction of the board be followed[.]" "In a few instances, my defense of taxpayers, ratepayers and constituents was too ardent, and I apologize. To that end, I appreciate any constructive criticism I can take from this report to be a better advocate for the people I serve."

Director Kremen has not apologized to the Sierra Club for his inappropriate comments. Therefore, environmental advocates continue to be wary about participating in Board meetings to avoid inappropriate disparaging and offensive comments from Director Kremen.

The Sierra Club complaint requested that the Ordinance of Santa Clara Valley Water District Specifying Rules of Decorum in the Participation of Board and Committee Meetings "be equally applicable to the Board as to participating members of the public." The purpose of the Ordinance includes "enhancing civility and decorum" and avoiding "an atmosphere in Meetings that: is uncivil, threatening, and disrespectful; stifles public participation and debate; threatens the quality of decision making; or otherwise undermines the democratic process."

In response to the investigation report, we urge Valley Water to update the Decorum Ordinance, revisit Governance Policies as appropriate to encourage more civil interaction with the public, and institute annual training for the Board of Directors on appropriate demeanor and interaction with staff and the public.

Sincerely,

James Eggers

Executive Director

Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter

James Eggers

Cc: Charles Schafer Chapter Chair Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter

Katja Irvin Water Committee Co-Chair Sierra Club Loma Prieta Chapter